

REVIEW ARTICLE

Indoor Air Pollution & Its Impact on Public Health: A Review

Upma Singh¹, Ankita Garg², Bina Rani³, Raaz Maheshwari⁴, Magan Prasad⁵

1. School of Vocational Studies & Applied Sciences GBU, Greater Noida, UP

2. Department of Chemistry, FASC (MITS) Lakshman Garh, Sikar, Rajasthan

3. Department of Chemistry, Department of Engineering Chemistry & Environmental Engineering, PCE, Sitapura, Jaipur, Rajasthan

4. Department of Chemistry, SBRMGC, Nagaur, Rajasthan

5. Department of Chemistry, MSJGC, Bharatpur, Rajasthan

In many people's minds air pollution is associated with the contamination of urban air from automobile exhausts and industrial effluents. However, in developing countries, the problem of indoor air pollution far outweighs the ambient air pollution. There are four principal sources of pollutants of indoor air: (i) combustion, (ii) building material, (iii) the ground under the building, and (iv) bioaerosols. In developed countries the most important indoor air pollutants are radon, asbestos, volatile organic compounds, pesticides, heavy metals, animal dander, mites, moulds and environmental tobacco smoke. However, in developing countries the most important indoor air pollutants are the combustion products of unprocessed solid biomass fuels used by the poor urban and rural folk for cooking and heating. Approximately half the world's population and up to 90% of rural households in developing countries still rely on unprocessed biomass fuels such as wood, dung and crop residues. A recent report of the World Health Organization (WHO) asserts the rule of 1000 which states that a pollutant released indoors is one thousand times more likely to reach people's lung than a pollutant released outdoors. It has been estimated that about half a million women and children die each year from indoor air pollution in India. Compared to other countries, India has among the largest burden of disease due to the use of dirty household fuels and 28% of all deaths due to indoor air pollution in developing countries occur in India. The type of fuels used by a household is determined mainly by its economic status. In the energy ladder, biomass fuels namely animal dung, crop residues and wood, which are the dirtiest fuels, lie at the bottom and are used mostly by very poor people. Electricity, which is the most expensive, lies at the top of ladder and it is also the cleanest fuel.

The 1991 National Census for the first time inquired about the fuel used for cooking. It revealed that about 90% of the rural population relied upon the biomass fuels like animal dung, crop residues and wood. A small portion used coal. Nation-wide about 78% of the population relied upon the biomass fuels and 3% on coal.

MAJOR AIR POLLUTANTS RELEASED FROM BIOMASS COMBUSTION

It has been estimated that more than half world's households cook their food on the unprocessed solid fuels that typically release at least 50 times more noxious pollutants than gas. The stoves or *chullah* used for cooking are not energy efficient. The fuels are not burned completely. The incomplete combustion of biomass releases complex mixture of organic compounds, which include suspended particulate matter, carbon monoxide, poly organic material (POM), poly aromatic hydrocarbons (PAH), formaldehyde, *etc.* The biomass may also contain intrinsic contaminants such as sulphur, trace metals, *etc.*

Particulates

In recent years a large number of studies of health impact of suspended particulate air pollution have been undertaken in developing countries. These studies show remarkable consistency in the relationship observed between changes in daily ambient suspended particulate levels and changes in mortality. Smith⁸ estimated the health risk from exposure to particulate air pollution by applying the mean risk per unit ambient concentrations based on the results of some urban epidemiological studies. The range of risk was found to be 1.2 - 4.4% increased mortality per 10 mg/m³

incremental increase in concentration of respirable suspended particles (PM). For the calculations of estimates, it was assumed that the health risk has linear relationship to exposure, the risk factors determined for urban centres of developed nations were used as standards; where the PM data were not available, 50% of suspended particulate matter (SPM) levels were considered as equivalent. The above assumptions may add to inaccuracy already inherent in such estimates.

Carbon Monoxide

Incomplete combustion of fuels produces carbon monoxide (CO). The CO and particle emission pose a serious problem when biomass fuels are used. Smith has estimated that about 38, 17, 5 and 2 g/meal carbon monoxide is released during the household cooking, using dung, crop residues, wood and kerosene respectively. During the use of liquid petroleum gas (LPG) a negligible amount of CO is released. A study by the National Institute of Occupational Health (NIOH), Ahmedabad reported indoor air CO levels of 144, 156, 94, 108 and 14 mg/m³ air during cooking by dung, wood, coal, kerosene and LPG respectively. The short-term health effects of CO exposure are dizziness, headache, nausea, feeling of weakness, *etc.* The association between long-term exposure to carbon monoxide from cigarette smoke and heart disease and foetal development has been described by several authors.

Poly Organic Material and Poly Aromatic Hydrocarbons

Poly organic material is a loose term used to depict a group of chemicals having two or more rings. Of several chemicals included in this group, the PAHs have attracted interest for their possible carcinogenic effects. In addition to PAH, azo and arino compounds have also been found to be potentially carcinogenic. Most other categories of POM are of less environmental interest or are not found in large amounts in organic combustion products. Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons constitute a large class of compounds released during the incomplete combustion or pyrolysis of organic matter. They are often called polynuclear aromatic (PNA) because they contain three or more aromatic rings that share carbon atoms. Benzo(a)pyrene (BaP) is one of the most important carcinogen of the group. Often it is measured to indicate the presence or absence of PAHs although the relationship between BaP content and actual carcinogenicity may be weak. Anthracene and phenanthracene are not carcinogens but methyl additions may render them carcinogenic. PAHs are activated by the hepatic microsomal enzyme system to carcinogenic forms that bind covalently to DNA. Study by NIOH showed that the indoor levels of PAH (total) during use of dung, wood, coal, kerosene and LPG were 3.56, 2.01, 0.55, 0.23 and 0.13 g/m³ of air respectively. These PAH were fluorene, pyrene, chrysene, benzoanthracene, benzofluoranthene, benzofluoranthene, benzopyrene, dibenz anthracene, benzoperylene and indeno pyrene. All these PAHs except the first three have been classified as possible carcinogens.

Formaldehyde

Formaldehyde levels were measured in indoor environment during cooking by different fuels. The formaldehyde mean levels were 670, 652, 109, 112 and 68 g/m³ of air for cattle dung, wood, coal, kerosene and LPG respectively. The formaldehyde is well recognized to be an acute irritant and long-term exposure can cause a reduction in vital capacity and chronic bronchitis. The formaldehyde is well known to form crosslinks with biologic macro-molecules. Inhaled formaldehyde forms DNA and DNA-protein cross-links in the nasal respiratory mucosa. The formaldehyde has been shown to be carcinogenic in a dose dependent fashion in rodents. The studies done in workers occupationally exposed to formaldehyde have consistently (11 of 13 studies reviewed) shown higher incidence of leukaemia. In an epidemiological study in UK, significantly excess mortality from lung cancer was observed in workers exposed to high levels of formaldehyde.

Mutagenic Activity of the Smoke Particulate Extract

Microbial tests are widely used as a screening tool for assessing mutagenic potential of chemical substances. The particulate matter in the smoke generated as a result of incomplete combustion of biomass fuels contains a number of organic compounds. To evaluate their carcinogenic potential, it is necessary to screen their mutagenicity through simple and rapid microbial assay as a first step.

Ames assay is simple and sensitive enough to measure mutagenicity of air-borne particulates, so that many

researchers have applied this assay to demonstrate the ambient carcinogenic and mutagenic compounds in the extractable organic matter from air-borne particulates. Mutagenic response of complex mixtures of polycyclic organic matter from the combustion of biomass energy fuels was studied using tester strains TA 98 and TA 100 of *Salmonella typhimurium* which can detect the presence of frame-shift and base-pair mutagens. The results indicated that the organic residues of smoke particulates of wood and cattle dung fuels contained direct acting frameshift mutagens and cattle dung contained only direct acting base-pair mutagens while indirect acting frame-shift and base-pair mutagens were found to present in smoke particulates of both the energy fuels.

SPECIFIC DISEASES ASSOCIATED WITH INDOOR AIR POLLUTANT EXPOSURE

Respiratory illness, cancer, tuberculosis, perinatal outcomes including low birth weight, and eye diseases are the morbidities associated with indoor air pollution.

Respiratory Illness

The effect of air pollutants in general would depend on the composition of the air that is inhaled which will depend on the type of fuel used and the conditions of combustion, ventilation and duration for which the inhalation occur. The most commonly reported and obvious health effect of indoor air pollutants is the increase in the incidence of respiratory morbidity. Studies by the NIOH on the prevalence of respiratory symptoms in women using traditional fuels (biomass) (n=175) and LPG (n=99), matched for economic status and age, indicated that the relative risk (with 95% C.I.) for cough, and shortness of breath (dyspnoea) was 3.2 (1.6-6.7), and 4.6 (1.2-18.2) respectively.

Childhood acute respiratory infections

Acute lower respiratory infections: Acute respiratory infections (ARIs) are the single most important cause of mortality in children aged less than 5 years, accounting for around 3-5 million deaths annually in this age group. Many studies in developing countries have reported on the association between exposure to indoor air pollution and acute lower respiratory infections. The studies on indoor air pollution from household biomass fuel are reasonably consistent and, as a group, show a significant increase in risk for exposed young children compared with those living in households using cleaner fuels or being otherwise less exposed. Some of the studies carried out in India have reported no association between use of biomass fuels and ARI in children. In a case-control study in children under five years of age in south Kerala, where children with severe pneumonia as ascertained by WHO criteria were compared with those having nonsevere ARI attending outpatient department, the fuel used for cooking was not a significant risk factor for severe ARI. Non-severe ARI controls may represent the continuum (predecessor) of the cases themselves. In a cross-sectional study in 642 infants dwelling in urban slums of Delhi and using wood and kerosene respectively, did not find a significant difference in the prevalence of acute lower respiratory tract infections and the fuel type.

Upper respiratory tract infections and otitis media: Studies on the relationship between indoor air pollution and acute upper respiratory infections in children both from developed and developing nations have not been able to demonstrate the relationship between the two. However, there is strong evidence that exposure to environmental tobacco smoke causes middle ear disease. A recent meta-analysis reported an odds ratio of 1.48 (1.08-2.04) for recurrent otitis media if either parent smoked, and one of 1.38 (1.23-1.55) for middle ear effusion in the same circumstances. A clinic based case-control study of children in rural New York state reported an adjusted odds ratio for otitis media, involving two or more separate episodes, of 1.73 (1.03-2.89) for exposure to wood burning stoves.

Chronic pulmonary diseases

Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and chronic corpulmonale: In developed countries, smoking is responsible for over 80% of cases of chronic bronchitis and for most cases of emphysema and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. It was pointed out to the relationship between exposure to indoor air pollutants and chronic obstructive lung disease leading to chronic corpulmonale. These studies showed that in India, the incidence of chronic corpulmonale is similar in men and women despite the fact that 75% of the men and only 10% women are smokers.

Further analysis of the cases of chronic corpulmonale in men and women showed that chronic corpulmonale was more common in younger women. Chronic corpulmonale seemed to occur 10-15 years earlier in women. The prevalence of chronic corpulmonale was lower in the southern states than the northern states of India. This is attributed to higher ambient temperatures during most part of the year allowing for greater ventilation in the houses during cooking. The authors attributed this higher prevalence of chronic corpulmonale in women to domestic air pollution as a result of the burning of solid biomass fuels leading to chronic bronchitis and emphysema which result in chronic corpulmonale. Subsequent studies in India confirmed these findings. Numerous studies from other countries, including ones with cross-sectional and case-control designs, have reported on the association between exposure to biomass smoke and chronic bronchitis or chronic obstructive pulmonary disease.

Pneumoconiosis: Pneumoconiosis is a disease of industrial workers occupationally exposed to fine mineral dust particles over a long time. The disease is most frequently seen in miners. Cases of respiratory morbidity who did not respond to routine treatment and whose radiological picture resembled pneumoconiosis have been reported in Ladakh. However, there are no industries or mines in any part of Ladakh and therefore exposure to dust from these sources was ruled out. Two factors considered responsible for the development of this respiratory morbidity were (i) Exposure to dust from dust storms. In the spring dust storms occur in many parts of Ladakh. During these storms the affected villages are covered by a thick blanket of fine dust, and the inhabitants are exposed to a considerable amount of dust for several days. The frequency, duration and severity of these dust storms vary considerably from village to village; (ii) Exposure to soot – due to the severe cold in Ladakh, ventilation in the houses is kept at a minimum. The fire place is used for both cooking and heating purposes. To conserve fuel during non-cooking periods, the wood is not allowed to burn quickly but is kept smouldering to prolong its slow heating effect. The inmates are thus exposed to high concentrations of soot.

The clinico-radiological investigations of 449 randomly selected villagers from three villages having mild, moderate and severe dust storms showed prevalence of pneumoconiosis of 2.0, 20.1 and 45.3% respectively. The chest radiographs of the villagers showed radiological characteristics which were indistinguishable from those found in miners and industrial workers suffering from pneumoconiosis. The dust concentrations in the kitchens without chimneys varied from 3.22 to 11.30 mg/m³ with a mean of 7.50 mg/m³. The free silica content of these dust samples was below 1%. Dust samples sufficient to allow measurement of the dust concentrations could not be collected during the periods of dust storms. A preliminary analysis of the settled dust samples collected immediately after the storms indicated that about 80% of the dust was respirable and the free silica content ranged between 60 and 70%. Detailed statistical analysis of the data showed that the frequency of dust storms, use of chimney in the houses and age were the most important factors related to the development of pneumoconiosis.

Thus, the results of medical and radiological investigations positively established the occurrence of pneumoconiosis in epidemic proportion. Exposure to free silica from dust storms and soot from domestic fuel were suggested as the causes of pneumoconiosis. Low oxygen levels or some other factor associated with high altitude may be an important contributory factor in causation of pneumoconiosis because it has been reported that the miners working at high altitude are more prone to develop pneumoconiosis than their counterparts exposed to the same levels of dust and working in the mines at normal altitude.

Lung Cancer

The link between lung cancer in Chinese women and cooking on an open coal stove has been well established. Smoking is a major risk factor for lung cancer, however, about two-thirds of the lung cancers were reported in non-smoking women in China, India and Mexico. The presence of previous lung disease, for example tuberculosis which is common in Indian women, is a risk factor for development of lung cancer in non-smokers⁶⁵. The smoke from biomass fuels contain a large number of compounds such as poly aromatic hydrocarbons, formaldehyde, *etc.* known for their mutagenic and carcinogenic activities, but there is a general lack of epidemiological evidence connecting lung cancer with biomass fuel exposure. The factors associated with rural environment may have a modulating effect on the occurrence of lung cancer and therefore the low incidence of lung cancer in Indian women should not lead to a final conclusion of no link between biomass

exposure and lung cancer. It may be concluded that at present there is limited evidence of indoor exposure from coal fires leading to lung cancer and there is no evidence for the biomass fuels. Further investigations are needed to reach definite conclusions.

Pulmonary Tuberculosis

It was recently reported the association between use of biomass fuels and pulmonary tuberculosis on the basis of analysis of data collected on 260,000 Indian adults interviewed during the 1992-93 National Family Health Survey. Persons living in households burning biomass fuels were reported to have odd ratio of 2.58 (1.98-3.37) compared to the persons using cleaner fuel, with an adjustment for confounding factors such as separate kitchen, indoor overcrowding, age, gender, urban or rural residence and caste. The analysis further indicated that, among persons aged 20 years and above, 51% of the prevalence of active tuberculosis was attributed to smoke from cooking fuel. However, this study has inherent weakness that the cases of tuberculosis were self reported. There is strong possibility of false reporting as no investigation was done to confirm the reliability of the reporting. Similar findings were reported from northern India. This study did not control for the confounding factors except for age. There is experimental evidence to show that the exposure to wood smoke may increase susceptibility of the lungs to infections. Exposure to smoke interferes with the mucociliary defences of the lungs and decreases several antibacterial properties of lung macrophages, such as adherence to glass, phagocytic rate and the number of bacteria phagocytosed. Chronic exposure to tobacco smoke also decreases cellular immunity, antibody production and local bronchial immunity, and there is increased susceptibility to infection and cancer. Indeed, tobacco smoke has been associated with tuberculosis. Although the evidence in favour of tuberculosis associated with biomass fuel exposure is extremely weak, there is a theoretical possibility of such an association and considering the public health importance of the problem further experimental and epidemiological studies are necessary.

Cataract

During cooking particularly with biomass fuels, air has to be blown into the fire from time to time especially when the fuel is moist and the fire is smouldering. This causes considerable exposure of the eyes to the emanating smoke. In a hospital-based case-control study in Delhi the use of liquefied petroleum gas was associated with an adjusted odds ratio of 0.62 (0.4-0.98) for cortical, nuclear and mixed, but not posterior sub capsular cataracts in comparison with the use of cow dung and wood. An analysis of over 170,000 people in India⁷⁵ yielded an adjusted odds ratio for reported partial or complete blindness of 1.32 (1.16-1.50) in respect of persons mainly using biomass fuel compared with other fuels after adjusting for socio-economic, housing and geographical variables; there was a lack of information on smoking, nutritional state, and other factors that might have influenced the prevalence of cataract. It is believed that the toxins from biomass fuel smoke are absorbed systematically and accumulate in the lens resulting in its opacity. The growing evidence that environmental tobacco smoke causes cataracts is supportive.

Adverse Pregnancy Outcome

Low birth weight (LBW) is an important public health problem in developing nations attributed mainly to undernutrition in pregnant women. Low birth weight has serious consequences including increased possibility of death during infancy. Exposure to carbon monoxide from tobacco smoke during pregnancy has been associated with LBW. Levels of carbon monoxide in the houses using biomass fuels are high enough to result in carboxyhaemoglobin levels comparable to those in smokers. In rural Guatemala, babies born to women using wood fuel were 63 g lighter than those born to women using gas and electricity, after adjustment for socio-economic and maternal factors. A study carried out in Ahmadabad reported an excess risk of 50% of stillbirth among women using biomass fuels during pregnancy. An association between exposure to ambient air pollution and adverse pregnancy outcome has been widely reported. Considering the association of LBW with a number of diseases conditions later in life, there is a need for further studies.

INTERVENTION

Adequate evidence exists to indicate that indoor air pollution in India is responsible for a high degree of morbidity and mortality warranting immediate steps for intervention. The intervention programme should include (i) Public awareness; (ii) Change in pattern of fuel use; (iii) Modification in stove design; (iv) Improvement in the ventilation; and (v) Multisectoral approach.

Public Awareness

The first and the most important step in the prevention of illnesses resulting from biomass fuels is to educate the public, administrators and politicians to ensure their commitment and promoting awareness of the long-term health effects on the part of users. This may lead to people finding ways of minimizing exposure through better kitchen management and infant protection.

Change in Pattern of Fuel Use

The choice of fuel is mainly a matter of availability, affordability and habit. The gobar gas plant which uses biomass mainly dung has been successfully demonstrated to produce economically viable quantities of cooking gas and manure. Recently, the Government of Andhra Pradesh has introduced a programme called the Deepam Scheme to subsidize the cylinder deposit fee for women from households with incomes below the poverty line to facilitate the switch from biomass to LPG. Such schemes will encourage the rural poor to use cleaner fuels. The use of solar energy for cooking is also recommended.

Modification in Stove Design

Use of cleaner fuels should be the long-term goal for the intervention. Till this goal is achieved, efforts should be made to modify the stoves to make them fuel efficient and provide them with a mechanism (*e.g.* chimney) to remove pollutants from the indoor environment. Several designs of such stoves have been produced. NIOH study showed significant decrease in levels of SPM, SO₂, NO_x and formaldehyde with specially designed smokeless stoves in comparison with traditional cooking stoves. However, they have not been accepted widely. Large scale acceptance of improved stoves would require determined efforts. The most important barriers to new stove introduction are not technical but social.

Improvement in Ventilation

In many parts of the country poor rural folk are provided with subsidized houses under various government/international agencies aided schemes. Ventilation in the kitchen should be given due priority in the design of the houses. In existing houses, measures such as putting a window above the cooking stove and providing cross ventilation through the door may help in diluting the pollution load.

Multisectoral Approach

Effective tackling of indoor air pollution requires collaboration and commitment between agencies responsible for health, energy, environment, housing and rural development.

CONCLUSION

Indoor air pollution caused by burning traditional fuels such as dung, wood and crop residues causes considerable damage to the health of particularly women and children. There is evidence associating the use of biomass fuel with acute respiratory tract infections in children, chronic obstructive lung diseases, and pneumoconiosis in the residents of Ladakh villages. Lung cancer has been found to be associated with the use of coal in China, however, there is no evidence associating it with the use of biomass fuels. Cataract and adverse pregnancy outcome are the other conditions shown to be associated with the use of biomass fuels. The association of tuberculosis and chronic lung infections with the use of biomass fuels has not been proved. Finally, there is enough evidence to accept that indoor air pollution in India is responsible for a high degree of morbidity and mortality warranting immediate steps for intervention. The first and the most important step in the prevention of illnesses resulting from the use of biomass fuels is to educate the public, administrators and politicians to ensure their commitment for the improvement of public health. There is utmost requirement to collect better and systematic information about actual exposure levels experienced by households in different districts and climatic zones and develop a model for predicting the exposure levels based on fuel use and other household data therein (exposure atlas) to protect the health of children, women and elderly individuals.